Implementing and Sustaining Evidence-Based Programs: Have We Got A Sporting Chance?

Blueprints Conference
April 8, 2010

Karen A. Blase, Dean L. Fixsen,
Michelle A. Duda, Allison J. Metz,
Sandra F. Naoom, Melissa K. Van Dyke
Frank Porter Graham Child Development Institute
University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill
A Sporting Chance!
There are Challenges

Science to Service Gap

- What is known is generally not what is adopted

Implementation Gap

- There are not clear pathways to implementation
- What is adopted often is not used with fidelity and good effect
- What is implemented can disappear over time and with staff turnover
Learning About Effective Implementation

Craft knowledge

- National meeting of EBP Program Developers
- National meeting of EBP Implementation Sites
- National meeting of Implementation Researchers
- Interviews with 64 Program Developers
- Work with Program Developers, States, Agencies across domains

Formal and scientific information

- Current Projects (Catawba County, Education, Early Childhood)
- Program Efforts and Replication Data
- Review of evaluation and research literature related to implementation

WHAT HAVE WE LEARNED?
There are Shared Challenges!!

Implementation is implementation in:

- Health and Medicine
- Mental health,
- Agriculture and Forestry
- Manufacturing and Business
- Substance abuse
- Child welfare,
- Education,
- Engineering,
- Juvenile Justice,
- Nursing, ...and more

They have similar implementation problems
They have similar implementation solutions
We can learn more ...more quickly
Positive Intervention Outcomes ≠ Effective Implementation

**Implementation** has not been achieved by doing more or better research on interventions.

The **usability** of a program or practice has nothing to do with the weight of the evidence regarding that program.

—“Evidence” on effectiveness **helps you select** what to implement for whom

—“Evidence” on outcomes **does not help you implement** the program
Data Show These Methods, When Used Alone, Do Not Result In Implementation As Intended:

- Diffusion/ Dissemination of information
- Training
- Passing laws/ mandates/ regulations
- Providing funding/ incentives
- Organization change/ reorganization
Problem

Children, families, and communities cannot benefit from violence prevention or intervention strategies that they do not experience.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INTERVENTION – The “What”</th>
<th>IMPLEMENTATION – The “How”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Effective</td>
<td>Effective * Actual Benefits * Inconsistent; Not Sustainable; Poor outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOT Effective</td>
<td>NOT Effective</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Poor outcomes

Higher Fidelity is correlated with better outcomes across a wide range of programs and practices

- School-Based MH Prevention Programs - PATHS
- Children’s Services – FFT, MST, Wraparound, TFM
- Adult Mental Health – ACT, IDDT, Motivational Interviewing
- Medicine – DOTS, Texas Algorithm, OMAP
- Education – HiPlaces, SWPBS, STEP
What works...

成功的实施需要一个推广者

推广者是个体或一群代表程序或实践的个人或团体，他们积极参与实施实践或程序，以实现高精度和良好效果。

推广者积累数据和经验知识，随着时间的推移，变得更为有效和高效。

推广者在提供的内容和如何帮助方面有所不同。
Implementation Framework

Organizational Structures/Culture

Evidence-based Practices

Purveyor

Fidelity and Outcome Measures

Practitioner

Fixsen, Naoom, Blase, Friedman, & Wallace, 2005
Implementation Framework

Organizational Structures/Culture

- Evidence-based Practices
- Purveyor
- Infrastructure (Train, Coach, Evaluate)

Fidelity and Outcome Measures

Fixsen, Naoom, Blase, Friedman, & Wallace, 2005
Active Purveyor Role

Simultaneous, Multi-Level Interventions

- Practitioners
- Agencies/Providers
- Management (leadership, policy)
- Administration (HR, structure)
- Supervision (nature, content)
- Local, County, State Context
- Federal Context

Copyright © Dean L. Fixsen and Karen A. Blase, 2008
Simultaneous, Multi-Level Interventions

- Practitioners
- Agency/Provider
- Management (leadership, policy)
- Administration (HR, structure)
- Supervision (nature, content)
- Local, County, & State Context
- Federal Context

Purveyor AND Intermediary Structures and Strategies

Purveyor and Intermediary Simultaneous, Multi-Level Interventions

Copyright © Dean L. Fixsen and Karen A. Blase, 2008
Sustainable Infrastructure

Intermediary Organizations (IO):
A state-based or statewide infrastructure to facilitate the adoption, implementation and sustainability of a number of evidence-based programs by:

- Broadly educating
- Assessing need, stimulating interest
- Assessing the “science”
- Connecting purveyors with organizations
- Helping adopters manage risk
- Ensuring implementation and fidelity
- Accumulating knowledge
- Building capacity
- Integrating efforts
- Managing ‘scale-up shifts’
- Assisting with alignment
Implementation Frameworks

Multi-dimensional, Fully integrated

- Implementation Drivers
- Implementation Stages
- Implementation Teams
- Improvement Cycles
Implementation Frameworks

Multi-dimensional, Fully integrated

- Implementation Drivers
- Implementation Stages
- Implementation Teams
- Improvement Cycles
Positive Outcomes

Performance Assessment (Fidelity)

Competency Drivers
- Coaching
- Training
- Selection

Implementation Drivers

Implementation Lens

© Fixsen & Blase, 2008
Sobering Observations

"All organizations [and systems] are designed, intentionally or unwittingly, to achieve precisely the results they get."

R. Spencer Darling
Business Expert

“The tyranny of the status quo.”

Fritz Oser
Educator
System Stability

EXISTING SYSTEM

Effective Innovations are Changed to Fit the System
Or Operate in the Shadows
(The Ghost System)
Effective System Change

EXISTING SYSTEM

EXISTING SYSTEM IS CHANGED TO SUPPORT THE EFFECTIVENESS OF THE INNOVATION

Effective Innovations are Changed to Fit the System
Or Operate in the Shadows
(Ghost System)

(Host System)
EFFECTIVE INNOVATION

Copyright © Dean L. Fixsen and Karen A. Blase, 2008
Positive Outcomes

Performance Assessment (Fidelity)

Coaching Systems

Intervention

Leadership

Technical

Adaptive

Integrated & Compensatory

Selection

Training

Coaching

Systems Intervention

Facilitative Administration

Decision Support Data System

© Fixsen & Blase, 2008
Implementation Frameworks

Multi-dimensional, Fully integrated

- Implementation Drivers
- Implementation Stages
- Implementation Teams
- Improvement Cycles
Stages of Implementation

Major Implementation Initiatives occur in stages:

- Exploration
- Installation
- Initial Implementation
- Full Implementation
- Innovation
- Sustainability

Two to Four Years

Fixsen, Naoom, Blase, Friedman, & Wallace, 2005
Implementation Frameworks

Multi-dimensional, Fully integrated

- Implementation Drivers
- Implementation Stages
- Implementation Teams
- Improvement Cycles
Implementation Team

- A group that knows the innovation very well (formal and practice knowledge)

- A group that knows implementation very well (formal and practice knowledge)

- A group that knows improvement cycles to make intervention and implementation methods more effective and efficient over time
Implementation Teams

- At multiple levels
- Integrated and Interlocking
  - Agency Teams
  - Community Teams
  - State Team

Focus is on
- Fidelity & outcomes,
- Alignment (funding and policy)
- Problem-Solving and Sustainability
- Capacity building
Linked Implementation Teams
Implementation Frameworks

Multi-dimensional, Fully integrated

- Implementation Drivers
- Implementation Stages
- Implementation Teams
- Improvement Cycles
Improvement Cycles

- Transformation Zones
- Policy to Practice to Policy Cycles
- Rapid Cycle Teams
  - Problem-solving
  - Practice Improvement
- Usability Testing

What Do They Have In Common?
PDSA Cycles

Shewhart (1924); Deming (1948); Six-Sigma (1990)

- **Plan** – Develop specific things to do
- **Do** – Do them (make sure)
- **Study** – See what happens
- **Act** – Make adjustments
- **Cycle** – Do over and over again until the goal is reached or the problem is clear (again)
Improvement Cycle Uses

Transformation Zones

Policy-Practice Feedback Cycles
System Change

Demonstrations or “pilots” are a place to start for innovations (“it’s possible!”)

Don’t usually lead to sustainable service and system change

- Random acts of innovation
- Person and passion dependent
- Can “ghost” system its way to success
- Executed by the “extraordinary”
- No replicable implementation infrastructure
Transformation Zone

A representative but manageable “service zone” to focus on

- Adopting and installing the innovation
- *And* implementation infrastructure development
- *And* organizational change
- *And* systems change processes

Copyright © Dean L. Fixsen and Karen A. Blase, 2008
Transformation Zone

- Install Innovations
- Develop Implementation Infrastructure
- Change System
A “vertical slice” of the service system (from the front-line to the Capitol)

- The “slice” is small enough to be manageable
- The “slice” is large enough to include all aspects of the system (providers, partners, service system, urban, rural, frontier, diverse communities)
- The “slice” is large enough to “disturb the system” – a “ghost” system won’t work.
Transformation Zone

Transformation Zones provide opportunities to...

- Manage the risks (most innovations don’t work at first) and experience intended and unintended outcomes
- Limit the damage (quick detection, recovery, repair)
- Document “what works”
- Consider the implications of scaling-up
Improvement Cycle Uses

- Transformation Zones
- Policy-Practice Feedback Cycles
Policy → Practice

Policy (Plan) → Practice (Do)

Policy Enabled Practices (PEP)

"External" System Change Support

Policy → Structure

Policy → Procedure

Policy → Practice

Copyright © Dean L. Fixsen and Karen A. Blase, 2008
Policy Feedback Loops

Policy (Plan)

Practice Enabled Practices (PEP)

Practice Informed Policy (PIP)

“External” System Change Support

Feedback

Study - Act

Practice (Do)

Policy

Structure

Procedure

Practice
System Alignment

Federal Departments

State Department

Communities, Regions

Provider Agencies

Practitioners

Effective Practices

FORM SUPPORTS FUNCTION

Implementation Teams
Implementation Frameworks

Multi-dimensional, Fully integrated

- Implementation Drivers
- Implementation Stages
- Implementation Teams
- Improvement Cycles
Scalability

What do we mean by “going to scale”

NIRN definition: An evidence-based intervention that reaches 60% of the population that could benefit

Copyright © Dean L. Fixsen and Karen A. Blase, 2008
Implementation and Scale -Up

First we *implement successfully* – then we scale-up ….successful scale-up requires attention to the science and practice of *implementation*

Need to start with “demonstrations” but within a plan to scale-up

Requires change at the
- Practice Level (Front Line Staff)
- Organization Level (Supervisor, Agency Administrators, Collaborative Groups)
- System Level (Funders, Government, Regulatory Bodies)
...Can we go to scale?

- EBPs now are “boutique” operations

- Now have convincing demonstrations that EBPs can be implemented in the real world

- Wonderful! But they need to be used and sustained on a scale sufficient to solve social problems

- Current estimates of some “best” usage data = 10% of the population who could benefit
Scalability Challenges

- It’s a long and winding road
- The infrastructure costs to build the road are not understood or accepted
- Requires *aligned* changes at many levels
- We aren’t always good at recognizing when it’s time for a “scale-up shift”
- Each “link” in the scale-up chain requires resources, rigor, and research
What Will It Take to Give Us A Sporting Chance!

Science Related to….
- Interventions and Programs
- Implementation, Organization and Systems Change

Funded Infrastructure (Drivers)
- Informed Communities
- Skillful Purveyors & Intermediaries
- Competent Providers
- Supportive Organizations
- Hospitable & Aligned Systems
- Leadership at All Levels
Integrate the science, practice, policy of implementation, organization change, and system transformation
For More Information

Implementation Research: A Synthesis of the Literature


Download all or part of the monograph at:
http://www.fpg.unc.edu/~nirn/resources/detail.cfm?resourceID=31

To order the monograph go to: https://fmhi.pro-copy.com/